



# Town Owned Vehicles: Cost & Process Review Follow-up

**TOWN OF TRUMBULL, CT**

October 18, 2019  
Therese Keegan  
Financial/Accounting Controls Analyst



[tkeegan@trumbull-ct.gov](mailto:tkeegan@trumbull-ct.gov)

Phone: (203) 452-5072

October 18, 2019

Mrs. Elaine Hammers, Chairperson  
Town of Trumbull Board of Finance  
5866 Main Street  
Trumbull, CT. 06611

Dear Mrs. Hammers,

I respectfully submit the enclosed report entitled Town Owned Vehicles: Cost and Process Review Follow-up.

The objectives of this audit were to:

- ensure implementation of 10/5/16 Town Owned Vehicle Audit recommendations,
- provide an overview of number and types of vehicles the Town currently owns, by Department,
- provide take-home vehicle analysis, by Department, as compared to prior audit years.

I would like to specifically thank Doug Bogen, Town Fleet Supervisor, Deputy Chief Leonard Scinto of the Police Department, Sean O'Keefe and Mary Wild of BOE for their assistance in the completion of this report. Also, thanks to the Town's Finance Department, as well as individual Town Department heads for their assistance.

Respectfully submitted,

Therese Keegan  
Financial/Accounting Controls Analyst

## Table of Contents

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
Background	4
Scope & methodology	4
Fleet composition:	
– By vehicle type	4
– By Department	5
Take Home vehicles	5
Comparison to proximate Towns	7
Status of 2016 Findings & Recommendations	8
Management Responses	9
Appendix:	
– Town Vehicle Use Policy	11
– Full text 2016 Audit Findings & Recommendations	15

**Background**

Reviews of Town Owned Vehicles were performed in October 2007, September 2011 and again in October 2016. The 2011 report data is not used for comparison in this report as the level of detail is not consistently sufficient.

Reviews consistently identified the following issues:

- Compared to proximate towns, the number of take home vehicles in Trumbull was considered excessive,
- Take home vehicle policy required updating,
- Vehicle maintenance was performed at three locations and centralization should be considered,
- The Town’s fleet of vehicles was aging and a plan to update the fleet was necessary,
- Vehicle documentation was decentralized, including title, insurance and maintenance information,
- Physical inventories were not regularly undertaken to ensure assets existed.

Three additional issues were included in the 2016 report:

1. 9 BOE employees were assigned take home vehicles and had not been taxed on the commuting value per IRS guidelines,
2. Town to review First Selectman take home vehicle tax methodology per IRS Publication 15-B,
3. Unless there is a valid reason for not doing so, all Town vehicles should be marked with the Town of Trumbull seal.

**Scope & Methodology**

The December 2018 Motor Vehicles plate report and the 6/30/19 Merritt Insurance Company report were obtained from Finance.

Finance reports were compared to listings provided by BOE, Police Department, Fleet Maintenance. Detail for all other departments was verified via direct communication with Department Heads.

**Fleet composition**

The Town of Trumbull non-commercial vehicles is broken down below.

Description	2019	2016	2007
Cars	19	34	52
Pickups	60	* 55	77
SUV's	64	46	-
Vans	19	23	18
Motorcycles	4	4	4
	<u>166</u>	<u>162</u>	<u>151</u>

\* 2016 adjusted (+10) for split between commercial/non-commercial

Non-commercial vehicles, by department, compared to audits of 2016 and 2007 is summarized as follows:

Department	2019	2016	2007
Assessor	1	1	
BOE	33	* 35	26
Building	3	3	5
EMS	3	4	4
Engineering	4	3	7
Finance	1	1	1
Fire Marshall	3	3	3
First Selectman	1	2	1
Golf	2	1	3
Health	1	1	
PW/Highway	24	26	35
Library	1	1	
Parks	16	12	13
P&Z	1	1	
Police	61	57	44
Recreation	-	1	1
Senior Center	4	5	5
WPCA	5	3	3
Pool cars	2	2	
	166	162	151

\* 2016 adjusted (+10) for split between commercial/non-commercial

### Take-Home Vehicles

Although there were 33 take home vehicles earlier this year, the number is now at 31. A comparative listing by department is provided on page 6.

Since the last review in 2016 movement of take home vehicles, by Department was as follows:

	2016	Added	Less	2019
BOE	9	2	(2)	9
BLDG	1	-		1
DPW	2		(1)	1
EMS	1			1
FINANCE	1			1
FIRST SELECT.	2		(1)	1
FIRE	3			3
HWY	5			5
PARKS	1			1
POLICE	7	-		7
REC	1		(1)	-
WPCA	-	1		1
	33	3	(5)	31

Per below, 31 employees currently utilize Town vehicles for purposes which include commuting. Rows highlighted below in grey indicate use of a take home vehicle has been discontinued since the previous audit, while rows highlighted in yellow indicate the addition of a take home vehicle.

Columns indicate whether vehicles are marked with the TOT seal, and whether the vehicle carries equipment necessary to perform at various locations. We attempted to capture callback information, but since some employees did not consistently enter the correct Novatime code, that information was not accurately captured.

Department	August 2019	June 2016	June 2007	Vehicle type	Year	Car Marked?	Equip?
BOE	Transp. Coordinator	Transp. Coordinator	Transp. Coordinator	SUV	2013	No	No
BOE		Driver's Ed Instructor		Car			
BOE		Driver's Ed Instructor		Car			
BOE	Maintenance Supervisor		Plant Admin	PU	2005	No	
BOE	Carpenter	Carpenter	Carpenter	PU	2008	No	
BOE	Plumber	Plumber	Plumber	PU	2007	No	
BOE	Maint.Team Leader	Maint.Team Leader	Maint.Team Leader	SUV	2015	No	
BOE	Maintenance Assistant	Supervisor	Supervisor	PU	2003	No	
BOE	Mechanic	Mechanic		PU	2008	No	
BOE	HVAC	HVAC	HVAC	PU	2008	No	
BOE	Electrician		Electrician	PU	2012	No	
BOE			Welder			No	
Building	Chief Building Official	Chief Building Official	Chief Building Official	SUV	2013	No	No
DPW		Director of Public Works	Director of Public Works	SUV	2016	No	
DPW	Facilities Manager	Facilities Manager		PU	2016	Yes	No
EMS	EMS Director	EMS Director		SUV	2014	No	
Engineering			Asst. Town Engineer				
Engineering			Town Engineer				
Finance	Director of Finance	Director of Finance	Director of Finance	SUV	2015	No	No
Fire Marshal	Fire Marshal	Fire Marshal	Fire Marshal	SUV	2016	No	Yes
Fire Marshal	Deputy Fire Marshal	Deputy Fire Marshal	Deputy Fire Marshal	SUV	2007	No	Yes
Fire Marshal	Sr. Fire Marshal	Sr. Fire Marshal		SUV	2012	No	Yes
First Selectman	First Selectman	First Selectman	First Selectman	SUV	2014	No	No
First Selectman		Chief of Staff		SUV	2006	No	No
Golf			Property Director				
Golf			Superintendent				
Highway	Fleet Supervisor	Open position	Senior Mechanic	PU	2008	Yes	
Highway			Supervisor				
Highway	General Foreman	General Foreman	Acting General Foreman	PU	2018	No	No
Highway	Highway Supervisor	Highway Supervisor	Garage Supervisor	PU	2011	Yes	
Highway	Highway Supervisor	Highway Supervisor	Senior Supervisor	PU	2011	Yes	
Highway	Highway Supervisor	Highway Supervisor	Supervisor	PU	2016	Yes	
Parks	Superintendent	Superintendent	Superintendent	PU	2016	No	Yes
Parks			Asst. Super of Parks				
Police	Chief of Police	Chief of Police	Chief of Police	SUV	2019	No	Yes
Police	Detective	Deputy	Deputy	SUV	2014	No	Yes
Police	Deputy	Deputy	Deputy	SUV	2017	No	Yes
Police	Lieutenant	Lieutenant		SUV	2012	No	Yes
Police	Deputy	Deputy	Detective	SUV	2017	No	Yes
Police	K9 Officer	K9 Officer		SUV	2016	Yes	Yes
Police	K9 Officer	K9 Officer		SUV	2016	Yes	Yes
Recreation		Director of Parks/Rec		SUV	2015	No	
WPCA	Crew Leader		Asst. WPCA Admin.		2017	Yes	Yes
	31	33	32				

**Comparison to proximate Towns**

The Town's 2007 audit reported Trumbull's 33 take home vehicles was excessive as compared to proximate towns. The information below is for comparative purposes and has not been updated since the 2016 report, which recommended Trumbull consider opportunities to cut back on this benefit.

Town/City	Population	June 2016				June 2007		
		Town	* Emergency	BOE	Total	* Town	BOE	Total
Fairfield	60,678	15	10	2	27	17	2	19
Milford	53,039	16	5		21	29	2	31
Stratford	52,092	14	3		17	21	-	21
Shelton	40,472	6	4	1	11	9	1	10
Trumbull	36,444	13	11	9	33	24	9	33
Westport	27,055	8	7	-	15	20	-	20
Monroe	19,744	6	3		9	7	-	7

\* Emergency = PD, EMS, Fire Marshals

\*\* Shelton count excludes 7 FD vehicles

## Findings & Recommendations

The Findings & Recommendations from the 2016 report were summarized and a “Status” column was added. The full text of the 2016 Town Owned Vehicle Audit Findings & Recommendations is available for review in the Appendix, page 15.

The entire 2016 Town Owned Vehicles: Cost & Process Review is available on the Town’s website.

2016 #	Finding	Recommendation	Status
1	During the review multiple vehicle policy documents were located. Some are dated, others not and it was not possible to determine which, if any, the Town wished to abide by.	The Town should formally adopt a comprehensive Vehicle Policy and ensure distribution to all involved. Once finalized the Policy should be added to the Manual and compliance should be monitored.	Complete; requires approval & distribution to employees
2a	Although recommended in the 2007 audit report and again in the 2011 audit report, no evidence of a physical inventory of Town owned vehicles was available.	An annual physical inventory should be a joint effort including Finance, Highway Department and a BOE representative. Auditor is available to coordinate.	Open
2b	Decentralized, unreconciled information made a physical inventory difficult to begin.	Although input and review from other departments would be required, maintaining vehicle information and documentation should be the responsibility of a single employee. Maintaining a single, accurate, master list of vehicles (preferably in MUNIS) would be more valuable than the time consuming separate lists we currently struggle with.	Open
3	Prior audits reported the age of the Town’s fleet was of concern. Older vehicles would have to be replaced, for which there was no written plan, and the repair work required by an aged fleet might become excessive.	a. A replacement plan is included in the proposed Vehicle Use Policy; this should be agreed upon and finalized. A cost/benefit analysis included in the audit should be updated periodically and appropriate action taken. The town might wish to consider not replacing some vehicles, but rather reimbursing employees for the business use of their personal vehicles. At the current IRS reimbursement rate of \$.54/mile, an employee would have to drive 20,716 business miles per year to equal the estimated \$11,000+ cost the Town incurs per vehicle each year.	Open
		b. The Town might wish to consider the possibility of decreasing the number of assigned vehicles and increasing the number of shared, pooled vehicles, available during the day to employees who may require them. The responsibility of coordinating use of pooled vehicles should rest with the Insurance Coordinator, who will log use and ensure drivers are properly licensed and informed of Town Vehicle Policy.	Open
4	Prior audits reported the number of Trumbull’s take home vehicles was excessive as compared to proximate towns.	Generally, take-home vehicles should be restricted to those employees who would: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• need to respond immediately to an after-hours emergency,</li> <li>• need tools or equipment to address the emergency,</li> <li>• potentially be called to more than one emergency location.</li> </ul> Since the cost to the Town consistently exceeds the take-home benefit to the employee, the Town might wish to evaluate the list of take-home vehicles and consider alternatives to this fringe benefit.	Open
5	Per IRS the value of commuting afforded via take home vehicles is taxable to the employee. Emergency personnel are excluded from taxability if vehicles are clearly marked as emergency vehicles, or if there is a valid reason why they are not marked.	a. Unless there is a reason not to do so, Town should consider marking all take home vehicles with the TOT seal.	Open
		b. Although 2 were originally reported, 9 BOE employees are currently assigned take home vehicles and have not been taxed on the commuting value per IRS guidelines.	Complete
		c. Per IRS Publication 15-B the First Selectman, as an elected official, is considered a “control employee” and should therefore be taxed under the Lease Value Rule rather than the Commuting Rule.	Complete

**Finance Responses:**

**Finding #1** – HR has prepared a Town Vehicle Use Policy which has been included in the Appendix, page 11. Upon approval and distribution of this Policy, items **3a & b, 4** and **5a** can be addressed.

**Finding #2a** – It is the intention of the Finance Department to initiate a physical inventory in the upcoming months. Accomplishing the inventory will be a joint effort with BOE, Highway, Police and Auditor.

**Finding #2b** – It is the intention of the Finance Department to discuss with Public Works Director the possibility of Highway personnel taking responsibility for maintenance of asset records, related documentation, and reporting requirements.

**Administration Response:**

**Finding #4** - Under Connecticut bargaining laws, changes to these arrangements require negotiations unless existing contract language allows the Town to take unilateral changes. In the current round of negotiations, we have attempted to modify those arrangements through bargaining but at this time, the ground rules prevent discussion of those efforts until a final settlement has been reached.

# Appendix



## **TOWN OF TRUMBULL TOWN VEHICLE USE POLICY**

### **Purpose**

This policy applies to any employee of the Town of Trumbull who uses their personal vehicle for official business or is assigned or uses a town-owned vehicle during the workday or as a take-home vehicle.

The policy is intended to:

- Provide town employees with procedural guidelines related to the utilization of town-owned vehicles,
- Ensure town-owned vehicles are maintained in a manner optimizing driver safety and vehicle life and performance,
- Ensure compliance with Connecticut Department of Motor Vehicles and Internal Revenue Service reporting regulations,
- Ensure town-owned vehicles and associated costs are accurately recorded and appropriately controlled, and
- Ensure personal vehicles used for official business are operated in a manner consistent with the requirements set forth in this policy.

All new employees who will be assigned work entailing the operation of a town-owned vehicle or who will be operating their personal vehicle for official business shall be required to submit to a Department of Motor Vehicles driving records check as a condition of employment. A report indicating a suspended or revoked license status may be cause to deny or terminate employment.

The employee's vehicle use privileges require a current valid driver's license, a copy of which is to be on file with the Town. The Town reserves the right to deny an employee the use of a town-owned vehicle due to a poor driving record, vehicle abuse, or violation of the Town's Vehicle Use Policy. The Town reserves the right to test any town-owned vehicle driver suspected of driving under the influence of drugs or alcohol.

### **Policy**

- Unauthorized use of the vehicle is strictly prohibited and will be the sole responsibility and liability of the employee.

- Town employees who commit parking or traffic violations while operating a town-owned vehicle will be personally liable for all fees, fines or liabilities incurred.
- Use of vehicles is limited to authorized town employees. No other individuals, including but not limited to family members, may operate or be a passenger in a town-owned vehicle unless allowed by contract or authorized by the First Selectman. An exception to this prohibition will be emergency situations, and transporting non-employee contractors involved in Town business activities and volunteers where authorization is granted by the First Selectman or his or her designee.
- Under IRS regulations, employees categorized as “24 hour on-call – Non-Emergency Service personnel” (see Vehicle Categories, below) are deemed to be receiving a commuting benefit. This benefit is considered imputed income by the IRS and an appropriate amount will be added to income and taxed accordingly. Therefore, department heads must notify the Town Payroll Department when an employee is assigned a take-home vehicle.
- Nonemergency employees assigned take-home vehicles shall maintain a mileage log indicating the odometer reading upon departure from home and arrival at their work site and upon leaving work and arriving at their home. Each day employees shall enter the data into the log and submit it to the Finance Department monthly. (See attached).
- It is every driver’s responsibility to operate town-owned vehicles in a safe and fuel efficient manner, abide by motor vehicle laws and operate vehicles with due care.
- Drivers of town-owned vehicles are responsible for immediately reporting any mechanical trouble or damage.
- Vehicle accidents are to be reported immediately to the police in the jurisdiction where the accident occurred. Once it is possible, the accident should then be reported to the Finance Department’s Insurance Coordinator.
- Drivers of town-owned vehicles are responsible for scheduling maintenance each 3,000 miles driven, or as recommended by Town Maintenance personnel.
- Town-owned vehicles will be fueled at the Highway Department’s facility.
- Firearms or other weapons are not allowed on owned or leased Town premises including town-owned vehicles. Possession of weapons on Town property by anyone other than a licensed law enforcement officer is grounds for termination.
- Drivers may not transport any hazardous material or waste in a town-owned vehicle or in any vehicle while on Town business unless such materials are ordinarily handled by the Town as part of normal business operations.
- Employees are required to report all motor vehicle moving violations received driving their town-owned or personal vehicle used for official business to the Town as soon as possible. This requirement shall not apply to parking infractions/tickets for personal vehicles.
- Employees must obey all traffic laws while operating a town-owned vehicle and personal vehicle used for official business, and failure to do so will be considered a violation of this policy subjecting the employee to possible disciplinary action up to and including termination of employment.
- Employees must use a seat belt at all times.
- Employees whose job requires that they maintain a valid driver's license must immediately notify their supervisors if their license has been suspended, cancelled or has had limitations placed on it.

- Employees are allowed to utilize cell phones in accordance with state law (hands free) to make calls while operating a town-owned vehicle or personal vehicle used for official business.
- Employees are prohibited from texting or using any other written communication features of the phone while driving a town-owned vehicle or personal vehicle used for official business.
- Smoking, including the use of E-Cigarettes, in a town-owned vehicle is prohibited.
- Pets are not allowed in town-owned vehicles at any time unless required as function of the employee's job duties.
- Supervisors are responsible for investigating each accident, including reviewing a police report if one is made, to determine if the employee was at fault. Supervisors are to take appropriate disciplinary action based on their findings consistent with this policy.
- Supervisors are responsible for ensuring that new employees have reviewed the policy and that this policy is followed by all employees. Supervisors are also expected to set an example for safe and responsible driving.
- Employees are responsible for following this policy. Failure to comply with the policy may result in disciplinary action, up to and including suspension, termination, or participation in a safe driving course, depending of the circumstances.

### **Vehicle Categories**

Vehicle assignments must be approved in advance by the First Selectman. Use of town-owned vehicles is classified into one of the following four categories:

1. Unrestricted Use – First Selectman and Emergency Service personnel including Police, EMS and Fire Marshals. Unless the First Selectman considers it unsafe to do so, vehicles will be permanently marked to indicate emergency service status; they may be assigned radio, computer or telephone equipment.
2. Restricted Use – 24 hour on-call Non-Emergency Service personnel  
Generally, assignment of take-home vehicles should be restricted to those employees who would:
  - need to respond immediately to an after-hours emergency,
  - be required to carry specialty tools or equipment to address the emergency, and/or
  - potentially be called to more than one emergency location.

These vehicles are not for personal use, other than de minimis personal use, such as a personal errand on the way home. Recipients of these vehicles are subject to imputed income and appropriate taxation per IRS guidelines.

Vehicles shall not be assigned as take-home unless contractual or documented as authorized by the First Selectman. These vehicles will be permanently marked with the Town of Trumbull seal, at least 12 inches in diameter.

3. Non-Take Home Vehicles – ongoing, regular use to provide a town service.

Vehicles are assigned to employees regularly required to travel to perform town business during the work day. Vehicles should not be used for personal business. Vehicles should be parked in a town-owned lot each evening or when not in use.

4. Temporary Use/Pooled Vehicles – unassigned vehicles for temporary or sporadic business use by a town employee.

Vehicle use shall be approved by a department head. Vehicles should not be used for personal business. Vehicles are for use during normal working hours, and should be parked in a town-owned lot at end of each workday.

**Full text from 2016 Town Owned Vehicle Review:**

**Finding #1:** During my review I located multiple vehicle policy documents. Some are dated, others not and it was not possible to determine which, if any, the Town wished to abide by.

**Recommendation:** The Town should formally adopt a comprehensive Vehicle Policy and ensure distribution to all involved. For convenience, a draft Policy is included in Appendix, page 16, for consideration and approval. Once finalized the Policy should be added to the Manual and compliance should be monitored.

**Management Response: Agree a comprehensive Vehicle Policy should be formally adopted, distributed and monitored with the assistance of the Internal Auditor.**

**Finding #2:** Although recommended in the 2007 audit report and again in the 2011 audit report, no evidence of a physical inventory of Town owned vehicles was available.

Decentralized, unreconciled information made a physical inventory difficult to begin:

- Vehicle listings are separately maintained by the Finance Department and by the Highway Department (via Fleet Manager), but the lists did not agree.
- The Finance Department provides updates to Merit Insurance, Inc., but the listing they gave back did not agree with the Finance list.
- Among the lists, VIN# was the common identifier, but input errors were not identified, reconciled, or corrected.
- Vehicles may be transferred to other departments; license plates are sometimes switched from one vehicle to another. These changes are not consistently recorded.
- Authorized gas pump access maintained by Highway via Fuel Master included 21 terminated BOE employees and 24 terminated Town employees. Terminations date back as far as 2000.
- Municipal license plates must be reported to the State of Connecticut's Department of Motor Vehicles biannually, but this report has not been completed for multiple periods.

a. **Recommendation:** For the preparation of this report 44% of Town's vehicles were physically observed (48% of non-commercial vehicles). A full inventory (100% of vehicles) should be accomplished annually, possibly during insurance card distribution. This will ensure:

- The Town is compliant with the Internal Revenue Service and State of Connecticut Department of Motor Vehicles reporting requirements,
- The Town is providing a complete and accurate list of assets to the insurance company,
- All supporting documentation is complete, accurate, and available; i.e. Certificate of Title, registration with proper vehicle identification number, etc.
- The Town is minimizing the use of fuel and maintenance resources,
- The Town is optimally utilizing the existing fleet,
- The Town is timely disposing of unused/unneeded vehicles and the Town is monitoring and safeguarding assets through disposition, which generally occurs via annual auction.

The annual physical inventory should be a joint effort including Finance, Highway Department and a BOE representative. Auditor is available to coordinate.

**Management Response: Currently, at the time of insurance card distribution, vehicle listings for each department are sent to department heads for confirmation of information. Finance updates master list from signed confirmations.**

**Agree that a joint effort physical inventory should be performed on an annual basis. Internal Auditor will coordinate and assist.**

- b. Recommendation:** Although input and review from other departments would be required, maintaining vehicle information and documentation should be the responsibility of a single employee. Maintaining a single, accurate, master list of vehicles would be more valuable than the time consuming separate lists we currently struggle with.

The Fleet Manager program is the logical place to capture comprehensive information. Program maintenance should be the responsibility of a single Highway employee who will:

- Regularly gather information from other departments,
- provide fuel statements to department managers on a monthly basis,
- safeguard vehicle documentation and unused license plates,
- ensure compliance with the Connecticut Department of Motor Vehicles,
- act as liaison with Insurance Coordinator,
- program and assign fuel keys; collect upon employee termination,
- assist with annual physical vehicle inventory.

**Management Response: Agree; Highway employee to be determined.**

**Finding #3:** Prior audits reported the age of the Town's fleet was of concern. Older vehicles would have to be replaced, for which there was no written plan, and the repair work required by an aged fleet might become excessive.

**Recommendation:**

- a. A replacement plan is included in the proposed Vehicle Use Policy (Appendix page 16).
- b. Additionally, a cost/benefit analysis was performed related to the cost of vehicles. Fleet maintenance costs for the year ended 6/30/16 are summarized as follows:

Cost Summary	2016
Fuel	323,846
Insurance	148,327
Repair - salaries	711,807
Repair - est. benefits (46%)	327,431
Repair - parts	369,700
	<u>1,881,112</u>
# of vehicles (incl. comm)	290
Ave annual cost per vehicle	<u>6,487</u>

The \$6,487 does not include the initial cost of the vehicle. Non-emergency SUV replacements currently approximate \$23.5k each, which if expensed over 5 years would bring the total cost of each vehicle to an estimated \$11,187 per year.

Once a vehicle becomes too expensive to maintain, the Town generally auctions it or sells it for scrap, and then replaces it. The town might wish to consider not replacing some of these vehicles, but rather reimbursing employees for the business use of their personal vehicles. At the current IRS reimbursement rate of \$.54/mile, an employee would have to drive 20,716 business miles per year to equal the estimated \$11,000+ cost the Town incurs per vehicle each year.

The Town might wish to consider the possibility of decreasing the number of assigned vehicles and increasing the number of shared, pooled vehicles, available during the day to employees who may require them. The responsibility of coordinating use of pooled vehicles should rest with the Insurance Coordinator, who will log use and ensure drivers are properly licensed and informed of Town Vehicle Policy.

**Management Response: Agree in general. Would be interested to know impact of average if costs could be broken down by equipment vs vehicles.**

**Finding #4:** Prior audits reported the number of Trumbull’s take home vehicles was excessive as compared to proximate towns. The report recommended the Town consider opportunities to cut back on this benefit.

To quantify, a cost/benefit analysis was performed specific to take home vehicles. The sample data below was selected from non-emergency personnel:

Commute 1 way	Commuting miles	Business miles	Annual miles	Value to employee @ .54	Cost to Town	Cost to Town per Bus. Mile
7	3,080	2,224	5,304	1,663	11,187	5.03
3	1,320	4,173	5,493	713	11,187	2.68
3	1,320	4,170	5,490	713	11,187	2.68
23	10,120	2,532	12,652	5,465	11,187	4.42
22	9,680	1,090	10,770	5,227	11,187	10.26

Generally, take-home vehicles should be restricted to those employees who would:

- need to respond immediately to an after-hours emergency,
- need tools or equipment to address the emergency,
- potentially be called to more than one emergency location.

**Recommendation:** In each scenario above, the cost to the Town exceeds the benefit to the employee. The Town might wish to evaluate the list of take-home vehicles and consider alternatives to this fringe benefit.

**Management Response: This is an Administrative decision.**

**Finding #5:** Per IRS the value of commuting afforded via take home vehicles is taxable to the employee. Emergency personnel are excluded from taxability if vehicles are clearly marked as emergency vehicles, or if there is a valid reason why they are not marked.

- a. The 2014 EMS Ford Interceptor is a non-restricted use vehicle and is not marked as an emergency vehicle.
- b. Although 2 were originally reported, 9 BOE employees are currently assigned take home vehicles and have not been taxed on the commuting value per IRS guidelines.
- c. Per IRS Publication 15-B the First Selectman, as an elected official, is considered a “control employee” and should therefore be taxed under the Lease Value Rule rather than the Commuting Rule.

**Recommendations:**

- a. The Town should consider marking the 2014 EMS Ford Interceptor, identifying it as a Town of Trumbull emergency vehicle.
- b. Taxability of take home vehicles was discussed with BOE personnel and they will do so for current year and going forward.
- c. Current year imputed income and withholdings to date for the First Selectman should be reviewed and adjusted if required under the IRS Publication 15-B Lease Value Rule.

**Management Response: Agree and will address.**