



Town of Trumbull

Town Provided Electronic Devices

TOWN OF TRUMBULL, CT

April 3, 2018
Therese Keegan
Financial/Accounting Controls Analyst



tkeegan@trumbull-ct.gov

Phone: (203) 452-5072

April 3, 2018

Mrs. Elaine Hammers, Chairperson
Town of Trumbull Board of Finance
5866 Main Street
Trumbull, CT. 06611

Dear Mrs. Hammers,

I respectfully submit the enclosed report entitled Town of Trumbull - Town Provided Electronic Devices.

The objectives of this audit were to ensure:

- policies exist for Town provided electronic devices, as well as for the use of employee owned electronics while at work,
- devices are issued appropriately and associated rate plans are cost effective for the Town,
- Town issued electronic devices are appropriately tracked and safeguarded and collected upon employee termination.

I would like to thank William Chin, Director of Information Technology for his assistance in the completion of this report.

Respectfully submitted,

Therese Keegan
Financial/Accounting Controls Analyst

Table of Contents

<u>Section</u>	<u>Page</u>
Executive Summary	4
Distribution & Monitoring Process	5
Findings & Recommendations	5
Appendix	9

Executive Summary

The Town (including PD and EM; excluding BOE) contracts with Verizon to provide cell phones to 86 employees, iPads or MDT units (Mobile Data Terminals) to 50 employees and Mifi or USB connection devices to 4 employees. There is currently no formal policy document outlining device acquisition parameters, use expectations or information sharing related to device collection upon employee termination.

All Town owned devices contracted for or issued to employees were within the scope of this review; by department they are as follows:

Department	Number of Devices				2017 Expense
	iPads	Phones	Mifi/USB	Total	
Building	4	3		7	2,275
Econ. Dev.		1		1	639
Emergency Mgmt.	1	1		2	1,138
EMS	1	1		2	672
Engineering	7	4		11	3,959
Fire Marshall	2	2		4	1,384
1st Selectman		3		3	2,062
Health	1	3	1	5	3,088
Highway	4	8		12	4,217
Parks	4	2		6	6,363
Rangers		7		7	
Police Dept.	1	29		30	16,052
Police MDT	24		1	25	11,851
Public Works		3		3	1,275
Public Works modem			1	1	135
Purchasing		1		1	432
Recreation	1	6	1	8	2,639
Senior Center		4		4	1,168
Tashua Knolls		1		1	592
Technology		4		4	3,125
WPCA		3		3	1,627
Total Devices	50	86	4	140	64,693

Information from this review will be used:

1. to prepare Policy & Procedures documents to ensure the issuance of Town owned devices receives appropriate levels of review, authorization and internal control:
 - devices are responsibly distributed, appropriately safeguarded and tracked and monitored, and collected upon employee termination,
2. to aid in the implementation and communication of a new hire/transfer/termination checklist, the use of which would ensure tasks are appropriately initiated, completed and documented.

Guidance should be included in the Employee Manual, in process by Human Resources Department.

Device acquisition, distribution and management

Town issued cell phones and iPads are managed by William Chin, Director of Information Technology. The IT Director can call a Verizon service representative, but he usually accesses the online Town accounts to purchase devices, to change or terminate services, to track usage and to download monthly invoices.

When it is decided that an employee requires a Town issued device, the Department Manager or the Director of Finance calls or emails the IT Director who chooses the appropriate device and associated plan. The IT Director manually maintains an Excel spreadsheet which includes:

1. Employee name and Department
2. Type of device (smartphone, MDT or iPad) including make, model and GB information
3. Telephone number
4. Plan detail including monthly minutes and data allowances
5. Monthly cost and upgrade eligibility date
6. Whether the employee shares minutes with other employees
7. Voice and data used, by employee, by month, YTD

In an effort to manage overage charges, the IT Director references the Town's online account periodically to review minutes/data used month to date (see example Appendix page 10). Because the worksheet tracks monthly voice and data used year to date, he is able to identify unusual activity, and he investigates as needed.

Police Department and Emergency Management cell phones, iPads and 24 MDT units were managed by Ron Kirby, Deputy Chief of Police (now retired). All Police Department phones, iPads and MDT (Mobile Data Terminals in vehicles) are on unlimited data plans, therefore usage tracking during the month is unnecessary. A spreadsheet of information is normally not maintained but the IT Director prepared one for the Police Department, similar to his own, for use in this report.

When monthly invoices are received, IT Director and PD device manager review and forward to Finance for payment.

Findings & Recommendations

Finding #1: The Phones and iPads provided by the Town are to enable users to conduct Town business and access email and/or other software licensed to the Town. The Town has not issued written Policies or Procedures specifically related to the use of personal or Town issued cell phones or iPads.

Recommendation: The Town should document Policies and Procedures related to Town provided cell phones and iPads. These Policies and Procedures should include:

- a written needs assessment indicating which employees require a Town issued cell phone or iPad
- documentation of issuance approval via signature of Department Manager or Supervisor
- employee signature documenting receipt of phone and or iPad; this will stay with employee's file and referenced upon termination

- phones and iPads should be used for business purposes only; employees should have no expectation of privacy; the devices are subject to the Town's policies and applicable law related to record retention and public availability
- the phones and iPads should be physically safeguarded
- devices should be password protected
- the Technology Department is responsible for equipment maintenance and installing/uninstalling programs and applications; personal programs or applications should not be added to these phones or iPads
- The HR Employee Manual should also be updated to include the Town policy related to employee owned cell phone use

Management Response: Director of Labor Relations has a draft policy which he will finalize and communicate.

Finding #2: When it is decided that an employee requires a Town (excl PD) issued cell phone or iPad, the Department Manager or the Director of Finance calls or emails the IT Director who chooses an appropriate device and associated plan. Approval for the issuance is not necessarily written or shared among departments.

Department Manager may not maintain a list of items issued to their employees. IT Director may not receive timely notification of termination; phone or iPad may not be collected from employee upon termination.

Recommendation: Looking at the bigger picture, upon hire the employee's Department Manager should be responsible for collection and maintenance of a list of employee's information and role requirements, to be gathered, issued, completed or tracked – see outline, Appendix, page 11; Auditor has reviewed this information with HR, Accounting, IT and Department Management; all agree such tracking is needed and a standard form and process would be helpful.

Upon termination Department Manager can reference list to ensure complete collection of Town property and an otherwise smooth termination process.

Management Response: First Selectman has agreed to aid implementation by communicating with Department Managers.

Finding #3: To mitigate potential overage charges, the IT Director carefully monitors minutes and data usage during the month. (Police Department devices are all unlimited data plans.) The Director can see the amounts used, but does not know on what or when the minutes or data is used. He does not question whether usage is business or personal.

Alternatively though, the lack of use or the lack of significant use may not be questioned. Minutes and data usage were reviewed for the six-month period 7/1/17 – 12/31/17.

TOWN DEVICES					
Minutes	# phones	GB usage	# phones	GB usage	# iPads
0	4	< 1,000	30	< 1,000	9
> 0 < 50	11	> 1,000 < 5,000	13	> 1,000 < 5,000	9
> 50 < 250	13	>5,000 < 10,000	3	>5,000 < 10,000	3
> 250 < 1,000	14	> 10,000 <20,000	4	> 10,000 <20,000	1
>1,000	14	> 20,000	6	> 20,000	2
	<u>56</u>		<u>56</u>		<u>24</u>

PD & EM DEVICES					
Minutes	# phones	GB usage	# phones	GB usage	# iPads
0	3	< 1,000	7	< 1,000	1
> 0 < 50	5	> 1,000 < 5,000	9	> 1,000 < 5,000	1
> 50 < 250	5	>5,000 < 10,000	3	>5,000 < 10,000	
> 250 < 1,000	11	> 10,000 <20,000	7	> 10,000 <20,000	
>1,000	6	> 20,000	4	> 20,000	
	<u>30</u>		<u>30</u>		<u>2</u>

Recommendations: Department Managers should periodically reevaluate the need for Town issued phones or iPads. It may also be possible for employees to share phones or iPads especially intra-departmentally and especially departments which utilize seasonal and/or part-time employees, such as the Park Rangers or the Recreation Department.

Management Response: First Selectman has agreed to communicate the review process, which would occur on an annual basis or as needed.

Finding #4: When an employee requires a phone or iPad the IT Director estimates usage based on other users in that Department, and reviews plans available at that time for the new phone or iPad. The IT Director manually enters the employee, device and plan data into the worksheet he maintains (See Device Acquisition, Distribution and Management, page 5).

Because the goal of the IT Director is to avoid overages, he is forced to choose a plan that accomplishes this goal, even though on the surface this might not be considered most suitable for the individual user. With such a goal he errs on the side of overpayment rather than overage. Currently 7 (27%) of the 26 iPads and 71 (83%) of the 86 phones are paying for unlimited data plans even though 90% of the monthly data is used by 25 (32%) of the 78 devices. Detail is provided in Appendix page 12.

Recommendation: It must be made clear to employees given phones or iPads that the devices are for business purposes only. Employee should be required to sign off on receipt of policy at the time the phone or iPad is provided to them.

The Town/IT Director should attempt a negotiation with Verizon whereby all employees share minutes.

Management Response: The IT Department’s primary goal in determining a device’s plan is to save money. Verizon analyzed our account in 2016 and helped us transition our individual device plans to a share plan to

reduce the cost of our monthly bill. We monitor the plan to ensure that we avoid voice and data overage charges at the cost of \$0.25 per minute and \$10 per GB of data. Overages, especially with data, can quickly increase the cost of the user's plan and exceed the cost of an unlimited data plan.

43 of 56 phones on the Town account and 27 of 27 phones on the Police account are currently on voice share plans that share minutes across the respective organizations.

The IT Department will continue to work with our account representative to ensure that our cell phone plans are appropriately sized and affordable.

Finding #5: If possible, when an employee terminates their device is set aside for another user. Practically speaking though, the device is already out of date; it is placed in a drawer and forgotten about. Inventory documentation is not maintained.

Recommendation: Devices should be evaluated at time of termination. If it cannot be immediately reissued, Town should consider resale.

Management Response: The IT Department recently learned that Verizon partners with a company to buy back old equipment and automatically issue a direct credit to our account. The IT Department will speak with our account representative for additional information.

Appendix



[Billing](#) > [Statements](#)

Current Usage

[View Bill](#) [Manage Share Plan](#)

Accounts:
 Search by:

The following reflects current usage since your last statement [?](#)

Days Left in Bill Cycle



Voice Minutes Estimate as of 02/07/2018 at 07:13 PM

Type	Participating Lines as of 02/07/2018	Lines Exceeding Line Allowance	Shared Allowance	Shared Usage	Estimated Overage
TALK-NATIONWIDE BUSINESS SHARE	52	13	9,300.000	2,274.000	0.000

Data Estimate as of 02/07/2018 at 01:28 PM

Type	Participating Lines as of 02/07/2018	Lines Exceeding Line Allowance	Shared Allowance	Shared Usage	Estimated Overage
DATA - NATIONWIDE FOR BUSINESS	1	0	1.419 GB	0.175 GB	0.000 GB

Data Estimate as of 02/08/2018 at 05:44 AM

Type	Participating Lines as of 02/08/2018	Lines Exceeding Line Allowance	Shared Allowance	Shared Usage	Estimated Overage
DATA - FLEXIBLE BUSINESS SHARE	20	4	13.850 GB	9.266 GB	0.000 GB

Department	New Hire Responsibility	Termination Responsibility
<p align="center">Human Resources</p>	<p>Collect employee information: Name, address Department, Manager Position, salary Social security number Tax withholding forms Other federal/state required forms Civil Service, etc. info Health plan; dependents, etc. Beneficiary, emergency contact Retirement plan info Assign employee number Enter employee data in MUNIS Notify Union reps</p>	<p>Notify health plan Inactivate employee in MUNIS Notify Payroll; provide information for final paycheck</p>
<p align="center">Payroll Department</p>	<p>Setup in MUNIS: Salary & tax withholdings Health plan withholdings Union dues Retirement contributions</p>	<p>Prepare final paycheck Notify Pension Administrator</p>
<p align="center">Department Manager</p>	<p>Perform & document needs assessment: Vehicle, keys, gas key Building, desk office, other keys Computer; desktop/laptop Software, application requirements Identify permission/access levels Credit cards, store cards, pcard Landline requirements Cell phone, iPad requirements Request email account setup if required Identify appropriate distribution lists</p>	<p>Notify HR, IT Schedule vehicle inspection Collect all keys; vehicle, gas, office, desk, etc. Collect laptop if applicable Collect credit cards, store cards, pcard Collect cell phone, iPad</p>
<p align="center">Information Technology</p>	<p>Computer acquisition & setup Software, applications setup Usernames, temporary passwords Email account setup Add to distribution lists Landline setup Cell phone, iPad acquisition & setup</p>	<p>Receive laptop, cell phone, iPad from Department Manager Disable username, access to all software applications Archive folders/email; disable employee access Remove employee from distribution lists Archive/clear data; reassign phone/iPad</p>

Analysis of use of phones and iPads with unlimited data plans:

Department	6 mo. Data
PD	-
PD	-
Parks Ranger	-
Recreation	-
Parks Ranger	-
Parks	-
Parks	2
PD	3
Parks	7
Health	22
PD	35
First Selectman	63
First Selectman	75
Parks Ranger	104
First Selectman	109
Purchasing	122
PD	251
Fire Marshal	284
Health	343
PD	414
Parks Ranger	472
Engineering	527
Fire Marshal	569
PD	614
Parks	615
PD	629
Economic Dev.	828
Engineering	845
Senior Center	869
PD	1,178
Parks Ranger	1,442
Building	1,484
WPCA	1,560
Highway	1,692
PD	1,731
Highway	1,843
PD	2,032
EM	2,145
Health	2,158
Parks Ranger	2,272

Department	6 mo. Data
PD	2,319
PD	2,450
EM	2,949
Recreation	3,096
Health	3,172
PD	3,321
PD	3,364
Parks Ranger	3,843
Health	4,104
PD	4,407
Engineering	4,701
PD	5,138
Public Works	6,774
PD	6,945
EMS	8,430
Recreation	9,326
PD	9,579
PD	11,354
PD	11,587
PD	11,773
PD	13,774
PD	14,083
PD	14,996
Recreation	15,772
PD	17,314
Highway	19,495
Technology	19,502
Technology	24,130
PD	27,792
Tashua Knolls	34,412
Engineering	37,838
PD	40,118
Technology	43,804
Highway	46,318
Technology	54,248
PD	61,466
PD	62,348
Parks	79,756
Total	773,140